

PURE HYDROGEN MODEL ATMOSPHERES FOR VERY COOL WHITE DWARFS

D. SAUMON AND S.B. JACOBSON

Department of Physics and Astronomy, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, TN 37235

ABSTRACT

Micro lensing events observed in the line of sight toward the LMC indicate that a significant fraction of the mass of the dark halo of the Galaxy is probably composed of white dwarfs. In addition, white dwarf sequences have now been observed in the HR diagrams of several globular clusters. Because of the unavailability of white dwarf atmospheres for $T_{\text{eff}} < 4000$ K, cooling time scales for white dwarfs older than ≈ 10 Gyr are very uncertain. Moreover, the identification of a MACHO white dwarf population by direct observation depends on a knowledge of the colors and bolometric corrections of very-cool white dwarfs.

In this paper we present the first detailed model atmospheres and spectra of very cool hydrogen white dwarfs for $T_{\text{eff}} < 4000$ K. We include the latest description of the opacities of hydrogen and significantly, we introduce a non-ideal equation of state in the atmosphere calculation. We find that due to strong absorption from H_2 in the infrared, very old white dwarfs are brightest in the V , R , and I bands, and we confirm that they become *bluer* in most color indices as they cool below $T_{\text{eff}} \approx 3500$ K.

Subject headings: dark matter — equation of state — Galaxy: halo — molecular processes — stars: atmospheres — white dwarfs

1. Introduction

The MACHO and EROS microlensing experiments (Alcock et al. 1997; Renault et al. 1997) have detected a sizeable fraction of the dark halo of the Galaxy. Between 40% – 80% of the halo may be composed of MACHO’s with a probable mass of $0.5^{+0.3}_{-0.2} M_{\odot}$ (Alcock et al. 1997). Main sequence stars within this mass range would be relatively bright and have been ruled out by direct observation (Bahcall et al. 1994; Graff & Freese 1996; Chabrier & Méra 1997). Since the mass function of disk white dwarfs is sharply peaked around $0.55 M_{\odot}$ (Bergeron, Saffer, & Liebert 1992) and that old white dwarfs are intrinsically very faint, the microlensing events can be naturally explained by a large population of old white dwarfs in the halo. While suggestive, this interpretation of the microlensing events is controversial (Charlot & Silk 1995; Gibson & Mould 1997; Chabrier, Segretain, & Méra 1996; Adams & Laughlin 1996; Fields, Mathews, & Schramm 1997). Ultimately, the nature of the MACHO’s causing the observed events can only be settled by their direct detection.

The analysis of observational constraints on the population of halo white dwarfs rests on models of the luminosity function which depends strongly on the physics of white dwarf cooling. (Graff, Laughlin, & Freese 1997; Tamanaha et al. 1990; Adams & Laughlin 1996; Chabrier, Segretain, & Méra 1996). One of the most important sources of uncertainty in the evolution of old white dwarfs is the physics of the atmosphere. In addition, reliable synthetic spectra are required to relate calculated cooling tracks to observations. For $T_{\text{eff}} < 4000$ K such spectra have not been previously available. Extrapolations from higher T_{eff} calculations, which have been commonly used in the analysis of observational data, are poor approximations of the spectra of these stars. This is a result of the dramatic effect of collision-induced absorption (CIA) by molecular hydrogen on the emergent spectra of very cool hydrogen-rich atmospheres (Saumon et al. 1994; Bergeron, Saumon, & Wesemael 1995, hereafter BSW).

Because pure helium atmospheres are much more transparent than hydrogen-rich atmospheres, cool non-DA white dwarfs have comparatively short cooling times and become extremely faint after 10 Gyr. They are not expected to be detectable at the characteristic ages and distances relevant to a halo population of white dwarfs. Furthermore, hydrogen-rich

white dwarfs are much more common than helium-rich white dwarfs. The observation of an old halo population of white dwarfs, in globular clusters or as a component of the dark halo, is primarily concerned with hydrogen-rich white dwarfs.

In this paper we provide an extension of the grid of models presented in Saumon et al. 1994 to pure hydrogen atmospheres in the T_{eff} range 1500 K to 4000 K and gravity range 10^7 cm/s^2 to 10^9 cm/s^2 . The opacities are updated and a non-ideal equation of state (EOS) is introduced into the calculation because of the high densities encountered in the atmospheres of very cool white dwarfs. We discuss these changes in the input physics of the model calculation in §2. The resulting colors for very cool white dwarfs are presented in §3. We conclude by discussing the consequences for studies of old white dwarfs in the halo in §4.

2. Model Calculations

The models presented here extend the calculation of zero-metallicity brown dwarf atmospheres of Saumon et al. (1994) to higher gravities and the cool white dwarf atmospheres grids of BSW and of Bergeron, Ruiz, & Leggett 1997 (hereafter, BRL) to lower T_{eff} . Details of the atmosphere calculation are provided in these references. Briefly, we consider plane parallel atmospheres in LTE with constant gravity. Continuum opacity is provided by collision-induced absorption (CIA) by H_2 , Rayleigh scattering by H_2 and H , H^- bound-free and free-free, H_2^- free-free, H_2^+ bound-free and free-free. Line opacity is negligible in these very cool atmospheres. These atmospheres all become convective at depth and we use the mixing length formalism to compute the convective flux. As found by Saumon et al. (1994) for brown dwarfs, convection becomes extremely efficient deep in low- T_{eff} models. Consequently, the convection zone becomes nearly adiabatic at depth and the structure of the atmosphere is insensitive to the choice of the mixing length parameter.

2.1. Opacities

For the range of T_{eff} of interest in this paper, the dominant contributions to the opacity are H_2 CIA and H_2 Rayleigh scattering at temperatures below $\sim 3500 \text{ K}$ and H^- bound-free and free-free for higher temperatures. The H_2 CIA opacity is very strong in the infrared and largely determines the shape of the

spectral energy distribution (SED) for $T_{\text{eff}} \lesssim 3000$ K. The H_2 CIA photo-absorption cross sections (Zheng & Borysow 1995 and references therein) have recently been revised by Borysow, Jørgensen & Zheng (1997). The new CIA cross sections are smaller above $\sim 1.2 \mu\text{m}$ and generally larger at shorter wavelengths. For densities greater than 10^{-2} g/cm^3 , collisions involving three H_2 molecules are no longer negligible and the frequency-integrated CIA opacity then takes the form (Lenzuni, Chernoff, & Salpeter 1991):

$$\kappa = \kappa_2 \rho^2 + \kappa_3 \rho^3,$$

where the ratio κ_3/κ_2 has been measured experimentally (Hare & Welsh 1997).

The H^- ion is an important absorber when $T \gtrsim 3500$ K and its abundance is closely tied to the abundance of H_3^+ which is the main positive charge carrier in these models. The H_3^+ ion is not a significant source of opacity but the structure and spectrum is quite sensitive to the partition function of H_3^+ used in the calculation of the chemical equilibrium. We have used the most recent determination of Neale & Tennyson (1995). The principal source of uncertainty in our models lies in the use of an H^- opacity calculated for an isolated ion. In the atmospheres considered here, the density can become large enough to expect the bf and ff cross-sections of H^- to differ from their zero-density value. To our knowledge, no one has attempted to compute temperature- and density-dependent opacities for H^- as a trace species in a dense fluid of atoms and molecules.

BRL present observational evidence for an undetermined continuum opacity source affecting the flux at B and at shorter wavelengths. They tentatively attribute this opacity to bound-free transitions from the $n = 1$ level of the hydrogen atom to higher levels which are broadened into a pseudo-continuum by pressure effects. We have not attempted to model this pseudo-continuum source of opacity. The importance of this opacity must decrease very rapidly for $T_{\text{eff}} \lesssim 4000$ K as atoms recombine to form molecules.

2.2. Non-Ideal Equation of State

In addition to updated opacities, careful consideration must be given to the equation of state (EOS) used in the calculation of very cool white dwarf atmospheres. In stellar atmospheres, the EOS plays a dual role as it provides 1) the thermodynamic properties of the material which affect the (P, T) structure and the

calculation of the convective flux and 2) the relative abundances of all species which are needed for the calculation of the opacity. Saumon et al. (1994) and BSW used an ideal equation of state to compute the chemical equilibrium between the various hydrogen species. BSW found that for hydrogen white dwarf models with $T_{\text{eff}} \geq 4000$ K, the departures from a non-ideal EOS could be neglected. This is no longer true for the very cool white dwarfs we are considering here and we have used a fully non-ideal EOS in this calculation. Our EOS is based on the model of Saumon, Chabrier, & Van Horn 1995 who consider a mixture of H_2 , H , H^+ and e and account for the interactions between these species in a realistic fashion. In the regime of interest here ($P < 10^{12} \text{ dyn/cm}^2$ and $T < 5000$ K), the molecular repulsion leads to an increased degree of dissociation of the molecules as the pressure is raised. By contrast, it is well known that an ideal EOS based on Saha equations predicts complete *recombination* at high pressures. Recent experiments (Holmes et al. 1995) have revealed that the EOS of Saumon, Chabrier & Van Horn (1995) underestimates the degree of molecular dissociation at high pressures. By modifying the interaction potentials used in the EOS calculation, we obtain a new EOS which is in excellent agreement with all of the available high-pressure data (Saumon et al. 1998). The present atmosphere calculations include this updated hydrogen EOS.

The non-ideal EOS does not include H^- , H_3^+ , or H_2^+ which are important for the calculation of the opacity. These are introduced as a perturbation on the non-ideal EOS, where their abundances are calculated from their respective Saha equation (Lenzuni & Saumon 1992). Density effects on the internal partition functions are described with an occupation probability formalism (Hummer & Mihalas 1988).

The effects of the non-ideal EOS are threefold. First, for given P and T , the density is reduced compared to an ideal EOS. This decreases the importance of H_2 CIA at depth in the models. Second, the strong molecular repulsion leads to a significant drop in the value of the adiabatic gradient (Saumon, Chabrier, & Van Horn 1995) which affects the (P, T) profile and the convective flux at depth. Finally, the pressure-dissociation of H_2 into H further reduces the CIA contribution to the opacity and increases the H^- contribution.

The effects of including non-ideal effects in the EOS are illustrated in Fig. 1 where models computed

with the updated non-ideal EOS are compared with models computed with an ideal EOS. The non-ideal effects are small for $T_{\text{eff}} = 4000$ K and increase for larger gravity and for lower T_{eff} . The decrease in the adiabatic gradient for $\log P \gtrsim 10$ is readily apparent in Fig. 1 since $\nabla_{\text{ad}} \approx \nabla$ at depth.

The contours in Fig. 1 show how the non-ideal EOS results in a gradual decrease of the H_2 CIA opacity and an increase in the H^- opacity as the pressure increases. The lower CIA opacity results in a slightly higher temperature in the radiative region of the model, *i.e.* the molecular cooling of the radiative zone is reduced. Triangles indicate the location of the Rosseland mean photosphere ($\tau_R = 2/3$). Note, however, that because the opacity is strongly non-gray, the level of the “photosphere” varies greatly with wavelength. For the $T_{\text{eff}} = 2000$ K, $\log g = 8$ model, the $\tau_\nu = 2/3$ level varies over 2.5 order of magnitudes in pressure!

3. The Colors of Very-Cool White Dwarfs

The synthetic spectra and atmospheric models of very cool, pure hydrogen white dwarfs are qualitatively similar to those obtained by Saumon et al. (1994) for zero-metallicity brown dwarfs. The main difference arises from the higher surface gravity of white dwarfs which enhances the relative importance of the H_2 CIA opacity. For $T_{\text{eff}} \gtrsim 4000$ K, the opacity is dominated by the relatively gray opacity of H^- , resulting in a spectrum similar to that of a black body. At lower T_{eff} , H_2 molecules become abundant in the atmosphere and the H_2 CIA opacity becomes important. The strong infrared bands of CIA greatly reduce the infrared flux and force the flux to emerge at shorter wavelengths. As initially reported by Saumon et al. (1994), the peak of the energy distribution of atmospheres dominated by H_2 CIA opacity shifts to the *blue* as T_{eff} decreases. The resulting SED is unlike any that has been observed so far. We find that in the entire parameter range we have studied, very-cool white dwarfs are brightest in the V , R , and I bands, and are very faint in the K band. Color-color diagrams are peculiar for most color combinations. The colors $V-R$, $V-I$, $V-K$, $I-J$, $J-K$ and $H-K$ all reach a maximum and then become *bluer* when T_{eff} decreases below 4000 K.

The colors derived from our SED’s ($T_{\text{eff}} \leq 4000$ K) are a very good match to those of BRL for $T_{\text{eff}} \geq 4000$ K. Small differences are caused by our use of up-

dated H_2 CIA cross-sections and of a non-ideal equation of state. Since the H_2 opacity is strongest in the infrared, the decrease in CIA and the increase in H^- caused by the non-ideal effects of the EOS result in a redder spectrum than for a model based on an ideal EOS model (*e.g.* the models of BSW and BRL).

From the three photometric bandpasses sampling the peak of the SED of very cool hydrogen-rich white dwarfs, we construct the $(V-R, R-I)$ two-color diagram shown in Fig. 2. Our models are shown along with the observed colors of a sample of cool hydrogen-rich white dwarfs (BRL). The synthetic colors of the models naturally extend the sequence of disk white dwarfs. It is an interesting coincidence that the oldest, and therefore coolest, observed white dwarfs lie just at the turnoff of the cooling sequence of Fig. 2. This is also true for other choices of colors. The reddest hydrogen-rich white dwarfs therefore have $T_{\text{eff}} \approx 3800$ K with $R-I \approx 0.7$ and $V-R \approx 0.7$. Cooler white dwarfs become very blue in this diagram.

White dwarfs with $T_{\text{eff}} \lesssim 4000$ K are very old and they cool at a constant radius. By extrapolating the mass-radius relation of white dwarfs with carbon/oxygen cores (Wood 1998; Wood 1992) we can compute absolute magnitudes from our synthetic spectra. Figure 3 shows our grid of models in the $(M_V, V-I)$ color-magnitude diagram. The curves connecting models with the same gravity are essentially identical to cooling curves. The turnoff of the white dwarf cooling sequence is located at $M_V \approx 17$ and $V-I \approx 1.4$. This turnoff occurs just beyond the observed end of the disk white dwarf sequence (Liebert, Dahn, & Monet 1988) and therefore corresponds to an age of 10 to 12 Gyr (*e.g.* Chabrier, Segretain, & Méra 1996; Hansen 1998). Halo white dwarfs are thus expected to have $V-I < 1.4$. The long-dashed line in Fig. 3 shows the locus of models with a gravity of $\log g = 8$ computed with an ideal EOS. The non-ideal EOS significantly affects the colors for $T_{\text{eff}} \leq 2500$ K or $V-I \leq 0.6$.

4. Conclusions

We have calculated the most physically complete white dwarf atmosphere models for pure hydrogen composition at very-low T_{eff} . Elements central to this calculation are the use of the latest opacities for hydrogen and the use of a non-ideal EOS. Previous models of very-cool atmospheres without metals (Saugmon et al. 1994; BSW; BRL) strongly indicated that the

onset of H_2 CIA opacity at low- T_{eff} would dramatically affect the colors of very cool white dwarfs. We confirm that the colors of a cooling white dwarf with a hydrogen-rich atmosphere reach a turning point and then become bluer as T_{eff} continues to decrease, a conclusion also reached by Hansen (1998).

The colors we have calculated for very-cool white dwarfs allow for the unambiguous identification of white dwarfs in searches for the population of MA-CHOs responsible for microlensing events in the direction of the LMC. Previous analyses of searches for halo white dwarfs can be reinterpreted in the light of our quantitative prediction of the colors of halo white dwarfs.

Evolutionary calculations for old white dwarfs are in dire need of reliable model atmospheres to serve as surface boundary conditions (Graff, Laughlin, & Freese 1997; Hansen 1998). It is the purpose of our calculation to make white dwarfs better cosmic chronometers for ages above 10 Gyr. This has immediate applications in the calculation of globular clusters ages from their white dwarf sequence (Richer et al. 1997), and in the determination of the age of the halo, if a significant fraction of its mass is found to be composed of white dwarfs. Since these estimates also provide an independent lower limit to the age of the universe, this method holds the promise of settling several important cosmological questions.

Finally, the low-resolution spectrum of an old globular cluster white dwarf would be truly unique among stellar spectra, its SED being literally sculpted by the strong CIA of molecular hydrogen.

We thank P. Bergeron and G. Fontaine for useful discussions and A. Borysow for kindly providing us with updated cross-sections for the collision-induced absorption by H_2 . This work was supported in part by NSF grant AST-9318970.

REFERENCES

- Adams, F.C., Laughlin, G. 1996, *ApJ*, 468, 586
- Alcock, C., et al. 1997, *ApJ*, 486, 697
- Bahcall, J.N., Flynn, C., Gould, A., & Kirhakos, S. 1997, *ApJ*, 435, L54
- Bergeron, P., Saffer, R.A., & Liebert, J. 1992, *ApJ*, 394, 228
- Bergeron, P., Saumon, D., & Liebert, J. 1992, *ApJ*, 394, 228
- Bergeron, P. Ruiz, M.T., & Leggett, S.K. 1997, *ApJS*, 108, 339 (BRL)
- Borysow, A., Jørgensen, U.G., & Zheng, C. 1997, *A & A*, 324, 185
- Chabrier, G., Segretain, L., & Méra, D. 1996, *ApJ*, 468, L21
- Chabrier, G., & Méra, D. 1997, *Å*, 328, 83
- Charlot, S., & Silk, J. 1995, *ApJ*, 345, 124
- Fields, B.D., Mathews, G. J., & Schramm, D.N. 1997, *ApJ*, 483, 625
- Gibson, B.K., & Mould, J.R. 1997, *ApJ*, 482, 98
- Graff, D.S., & Freese, K. 1996, *ApJ*, 456, L49
- Graff, D.S., Laughlin, G., & Freese, K. 1997, *ApJ*, 499, 7
- Hansen, B.M.S. 1998, *Nature*, 394, 860
- Hare, W.F.J., & Welsh, H.L. 1958, *Can. J. Phys.*, 36, 88
- Holmes, N.C., Ross, M., Nellis, W.J. 1995, *Phys. Rev. B*, 52, 15835
- Hummer, D.G. & Mihalas, D. 1988, *ApJ*, 331, 794
- Lenzuni, P., Chernoff, D.F., & Salpeter, E.E. 1991, *ApJS*, 76, 759
- Lenzuni, P. & Saumon, D. 1992, *Rev. Mexicana Astron. Astrof.*, 23, 223
- Liebert, J. Dahn, C.C., & Monet, D.G. 1988, *ApJ*, 332, 891
- Neale, L., & Tennyson, J. 1995, *ApJ*, 454, L169
- Renault, C., et al. 1997, *A & A*, 324, L69
- Richer, H.B., Fahlman, G.G., Ibata, R.A., Pryor, C., Bell, R.A., Bolte, M., Bond, H.E., Harris, W.E., Hesser, J.E., Holland, S., Ivanans, M., Mandushev, G., Stetson, P.B., & Wood, M.A. 1997, *ApJ*, 484, 741
- Saumon, D., Bergeron, P., Lunine, J.I., Hubbard, W.B., & Burrows, A. 1994, *ApJ*, 424, 333
- Saumon, D., Chabrier, G. Van Horn, H.M. 1995, *ApJS*, 99, 713

Saumon, D., Chabrier, G., Wagner, D.J., & Xie, X. 1998, submitted to Science.

Tamanaha, C.M., Silk, J., Wood, M.A., & Winget, D.E. 1990, ApJ, 358, 164

Wood, M.A. 1998, private communication

Wood, M.A. 1992, ApJ, 386, 539

Zheng, C. & Borysow, A. 1995, ApJ, 441, 960

Fig. 1.— Atmosphere model structures in the P and T plane. Models shown have $T_{\text{eff}} = 1500$ to 3000 K in steps of 500 K (from bottom to top) and a gravity of $g = 10^8$ cm/s². The heavy long-dash curve divides the diagram according to the dominant source of opacity. Contours show the fractional change in the Rosseland mean opacity arising from the use of a non-ideal EOS, with dotted contours representing a *decrease* in κ_R (see text). The contours levels are (from left to right): 2%, 4%, 6%, 8%, and 10%. The triangles indicate the level where $\tau_R = 2/3$.

Fig. 2.— Color-color diagram for pure-hydrogen white dwarf atmospheres. Each heavy curve represent a sequence of constant gravity models with $\log g = 7.5, 8$, and 8.5 (from top to bottom). Models with the same T_{eff} (labeled) are connected by a thin line. Solid dots represent the subset of stars observed by BRL with H-rich atmospheres and known parallax.

Fig. 3.— Color-magnitude diagram for pure-hydrogen white dwarf atmospheres. See Fig. 2 for legend. The long-dashed line shows the locus of models computed with an ideal EOS.





